

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

Document reviewed: IWSFG Standard1 – Criteria For Recognition as a Flushable Product

Due Date: 2017-09-01

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	85	1		Ge	Suggest replacing 'residents' with 'community' and edit the relevant sentences accordingly		
LG	93	1		Ge	Suggest rewording – wastewater discharge from toilets..... OR adding 'water' after 'urine'		
LG	100	1		Ed	Suggest replacing 'are led' with 'lead into'		
PV	120 vs 132	2 &3		Ge	Wastewater 'transport'.... vs wastewater 'conveyance' Suggest using consistent terminology through out		
PV	219	6.4.2 (3)	Figure 4	Ge	Not supported as the 'do not flush' message is not clear		

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	85	1		Ge	Suggest replacing 'residents' with 'community' and edit the relevant sentences accordingly		
LG	93	1		Ge	Suggest rewording – wastewater discharge from toilets..... OR adding 'water' after 'urine'		
LG	100	1		Ed	Suggest replacing 'are led' with 'lead into'		
PV	120 vs 132	2 &3		Ge	Wastewater 'transport'.... vs wastewater 'conveyance' Suggest using consistent terminology through out		
PV	219	6.4.2 (3)	Figure 4	Ge	Not supported as the 'do not flush' message is not clear		

1 Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. 2 Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 0 Terms and Definitions

Due Date: 2017-09-01

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	77	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		
PV	140	5.1.2		Ge	'force' OR 'pump'		
PV	154	5.1.4		Te	Consider adding 'and/or effluent' after 'sludge'		

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 0 Terms and Definitions	Due Date: 2017-09-01
--	----------------------

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat

1 Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. 2 Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	55	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		
PV	68	1		Ed	Delete repeated word 'these'		

1 Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. 2 Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 2A – Toilet & Drain Clearance Test – Toilet Clearance

Due Date: 2017-09-01

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	56	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		
PV	199-201	8.4	6	Te	Item 6 – it is not clear to the reader how the location of the location of the specimen be identified unless the drain line is transparent or the top of the drain line has been removed.  Need explanation		
PV	273	10.2	Table 1	Te	1 <sup>st</sup> - 5 <sup>th</sup> flush – record the distance – refer to above comments . Need explanation on how to measure the distance		

1 Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. 2 Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

**Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 2B – Toilet & Drain Clearance Test – Drain Line Settling**

**Due Date: 2017-09-01**

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial



**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 2C – Toilet & Drain Clearance Test – Drain Line Snagging

Due Date: 2017-09-01

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	80	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 2C – Toilet & Drain Clearance Test – Drain Line Snagging

Due Date: 2017-09-01

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	79	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		
PV	250	10.2		Te	Item 4 – Explanation is required that this agitation should not damage the paper placed within the beaker		
PV	261	10.2		Ge/Te	Consider rewording this sentence. Suggested wording:  .... Photographs of the <b>..top side and underside of the sieve.</b>		
PV	343	12		Ge	Consider replacing the word 'lower' with <b>'underside'</b>		
PV	426	Annex 2		Ed	Section A 3.3 is missing		
PV	553	A5.3.2		Ed	Incorrect section reference as 3.3 is missing		

1 Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. 2 Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 3A – Disintegration Test – Accelerated Bench Top Disintegration Test

Due Date: 2017-09-01

<b>Initials</b>	<b>Line number</b> (e.g. 17)	<b>Clause/ Subclause</b> (e.g. 3.1)	<b>Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/</b> (e.g. Table 1)	<b>Type of comment<sup>2</sup></b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Proposed change</b>	<b>Observations of the secretariat</b>

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	95	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		
PV	246	9.2/10.1		Ed	New paragraph for <b>10 Procedures</b>		
PV	303	10.3		Ge/Te	Consider replacing the word 'lower' with ' <b>underside</b> '		
PV	312	10.3		Ge/Te	Consider replacing the word 'back' with ' <b>underside</b> '. Also use consistent terminology to assist the reader		

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 3B – Disintegration Test – Slosh Box

Due Date: 2017-09-01

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 3B – Disintegration Test – Flask and Shake Table

Due Date: 2017-09-01

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	78	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		
PV	227	10.1			Consider replacing the word 'lower' with ' <b>underside</b> '		
PV	228	10.1			Consider replacing the word 'lower' with ' <b>underside</b> '		
PV	253	10.1			Consider replacing the word 'lower' with ' <b>underside</b> '		
PV	255	10.1			Consider replacing the word 'lower' with ' <b>underside</b> '		
PV	393				BellCo need further information as there are multiple businesses under this name		

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 3B – Disintegration Test – Flask and Shake Table

Due Date: 2017-09-01

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial



Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	64	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		
PV	178/179	8.1.1		Te	Confusing to reader - '.. combined Toilet Clearance the Drain Line Flow Test (IWSFG PAS 2B).  <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Firstly, use the correct title of the document as it appear in the document</li> <li>There are 3 tests under this title, namely 2A, 2B and 2 C. Why refer to 2B – if 2B only why need to combine?</li> </ul>		
PV	180/181	8.1.1		Te	Individual or collection of test samples? If individual, then needs to be put in separate sealed plastic containers. More explanation required.		
PV	257	9.2		Te	Refer to comments under 178/179.		
PV	302	10.4		Ed	Item 3, 10 a and 10 b , no such items– 10 (1) and 10 (b)?		
PV	334/335	12			Refer to comments under 178/179.		

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

**Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 4 – Settlement Test Method**

**Due Date: 2017-09-01**

<b>Initials</b>	<b>Line number (e.g. 17)</b>	<b>Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)</b>	<b>Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)</b>	<b>Type of comment<sup>2</sup></b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Proposed change</b>	<b>Observations of the secretariat</b>

1 Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. 2 Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	77	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		
PV	238 to 244	10.2		Te	Why keep the lid on after finishing item 2. Objective is to test under aerobic condition		
LG	244	10.2		Te	Item 6 – This would require mechanical aeration over 21 days. Removing foam stopper would not achieve DO level of 2 mg/L		
LG	248	10.2		Te	Air diffuser is NOT an alternative. Instead it needs to be provided over the test period to maintain the required DO level. (refer to comments above)		
LG		10.2		Te	In a sewage treatment plant, aerobic reactor would be fed with biodegradable substrate (ie BOD of influent sewage). In the proposed testing regime, the only biodegradable material is the product sample itself.  This sample may be insufficient to sustain a viable biological process over 21 days.  Furthermore, the proposed testing regime in this section does not mirror the municipal sewage treatment.  Also concerns the appropriateness of sludge pass through a 600 micron sieve.		

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

**IWSFG Template for Reviewer comments and IWSFG secretariat observations<sup>1</sup>**

Document reviewed: IWSFG PAS 5A – Aerobic Biodegradation Test

Due Date: 2017-09-01

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
PV	78	1		Te	Consider adding 'reuse/recycling'		
PV	194	8.3.4		Te	pH 6.0 is too acidic and will not recover the anaerobic digestion process (ie methane forming bacteria will not survive in that pH level). pH range is to be 6.8 to 7.4.		
LG	286/286	10.4		Te	Concern the appropriateness of sludge passing through a 600 micron sieve.		

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial

Initials	Line number (e.g. 17)	Clause/ Subclause (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat

<sup>1</sup> Adapted from the ISO/IEC Commenting template. <sup>2</sup> Te = Technical, Ge = General, Ed=Editorial